



**THE STATES assembled on Monday  
2nd November 2020, at 2.30 p.m. under  
the Presidency of the Bailiff,  
Timothy John Le Cocq, Esquire.**

---

**His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor,  
Air Chief Marshall Sir Stephen Dalton, G.C.B., LL.D. (Hon.), D.Sc. (Hon.), B.Sc., F.R.Ae.S.,  
C.C.M.I. was present.**

---

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Sarah Craig Ferguson – ill  
Connétable Alan Simon Crowcroft of St. Helier – excused attendance  
Connétable Richard Vibert of St. Peter – excused attendance (joined at 2.48 p.m.)

---

Prayers

---

#### **Standing Order 55A – meeting held remotely**

THE STATES assembled remotely, in accordance with Standing Order 55A, as the Bailiff considered that it was not possible to convene or maintain a quorate meeting in view of a substantial risk to the health of both States Members and the public.

#### **Tribute to the late Mr. Brian Edward Troy, former member of the States**

The Bailiff paid tribute to the late Mr. Brian Edward Troy, former Deputy of St. Saviour.

The States observed one minute's silence as a mark of respect.

#### **Subordinate enactments tabled**

The following enactments were tabled, namely –

Road Traffic (Lighting) (Amendment) (Jersey) Order 2020. R&O.125/2020.  
*Minister for Infrastructure.*

Covid-19 (Workplace – Twelfth Extension) (Jersey) Order 2020. R&O.126/2020.  
*Minister for Health and Social Services.*

#### **Documents presented**

Deployment and use of energy conductive devices ('Tasers') by the States of Jersey P.97/2020.  
Police (P.97/2020): amendment (P.97/2020 Amd.) – comments. Amd.Com.  
Presented: 30th October 2020.  
*Minister for Home Affairs.*

Draft Wildlife (Jersey) Law 202- (P.110/202): amendment (P.110/2020 Amd.) – comments. Presented: 30th October 2020. <i>Minister for the Environment.</i>	P.110/2020. Amd.Com.
Draft Act declaring that the Income Tax (Amendment No. 46) (Jersey) Law 202- has immediate effect: Addendum to P.118/2020. Presented: 29th October 2020. <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources.</i>	P.118/2020. Add.
Migration and Population Data (P.120/2020) – comments. Presented: 30th October 2020. <i>Chief Minister.</i>	P.120/2020. Com.
Land Transactions under Standing Order 168(3): Apartment No. 7, Block F, Les Quennevais Park, St. Brelade – Cancellation of Existing 99-Year Lease and Transfer of the Public’s Flying-Freehold Ownership. Presented: 23rd October 2020. <i>Minister for Infrastructure.</i>	R.117/2020.
Island Plan Review: Preferred Strategy Report. Presented: 26th October 2020. <i>Minister for the Environment.</i>	R.118/2020.
Land Transactions Under Standing Order 168(3): Jersey Heritage Trust – Forts, Towers and Ruins – 99-Year Lease. Presented: 26th October 2020. <i>Minister for Infrastructure.</i>	R.119/2020.
Land Transactions Under Standing Order 168(3): Grouville School – Land Sale and Boundary Ratification. Presented: 27th October 2020. <i>Minister for Infrastructure.</i>	R.120/2020.
Independent Review of Jersey Members’ Remuneration Process. Presented: 27th October 2020. <i>Privileges and Procedures Committee.</i>	R.121/2020.
Proposals for the payment of the 2019 tax liability of Prior-Year Basis taxpayers. Presented: 30th October 2020. <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources.</i>	R.122/2020.
Commissioner for Standards: Annual Report 2019-2020. Presented: 2nd November 2020. <i>Privileges and Procedures Committee.</i>	R.123/2020.
Review of the Jersey Care Model (23 October 2020). Presented: 22nd October 2020. <i>Health and Social Security Scrutiny Panel.</i>	S.R.5/2020.
Change to the Deployment of Taser by the States of Jersey Police Force. Presented: 28th October 2020. <i>Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel.</i>	S.R.6/2020.

Prior Year Basis Tax Reform. S.R.7/2020.  
 Presented: 30th October 2020.  
*Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel.*

### Notification of lodged propositions

Deployment and Use of Energy Conductive Devices ('Tasers') by The States of Jersey Police (P.97/2020): second amendment. P.97/2020.  
 Amd.(2).  
 Lodged: 27th October 2020.  
*Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel.*

Deployment and Use of Energy Conductive Devices ('Tasers') by The States of Jersey Police (P.97/2020): Second Amendment (P.97/2020 Amd. (2)) – Amendment. P.97/2020.  
 Amd.(2)Amd.  
 Presented: 30th October 2020.  
*Minister for Home Affairs.*

Draft Wildlife (Jersey) Law 2020- (P.110/2020): amendment. P.110/2020.  
 Amd.  
 Lodged: 21st October 2020.  
*Deputy of St. Martin.*

Jersey Care Model (P.114/2020): amendment (P.114/2020 Amd.) – amendment. P.114/2020.  
 Amd.Amd.  
 Lodged: 27th October 2020.  
*Minister for Health and Social Services.*

Migration and Population Data (P.120/2020): amendment. P.120/2020.  
 Amd.  
 Lodged: 23rd October 2020.  
*Deputy J.H. Perchard of St. Saviour.*

Migration and Population Data (P.120/2020): amendment (P.120/2020 Amd.) – amendment. P.120/2020.  
 Amd.Amd.  
 Lodged: 30th October 2020.  
*Chief Minister.*

Establishment and funding of the Fiscal Stimulus Fund (P.128/2020): amendment. P.128/2020.  
 Amd.  
 Lodged: 2nd November 2020.  
*Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawrence.*

Migration Control Policy (P.137/2020): amendment. P.137/2020.  
 Amd.  
 Lodged: 23rd October 2020.  
*Deputy J.H. Perchard of St. Saviour.*

Composition and Election of the States: Proposed Changes (P.139/2020) – amendment. 139/2020.  
 Amd.  
 Lodged: 27th October 2020. (re-issue)  
*Deputy J.M Maçon of St. Saviour.*

Composition and Election of the States: Proposed Changes (P.139/2020) – second amendment. P.139/2020.  
 Amd.(2).  
 Lodged: 29th October 2020.  
*Connétable of St. Clement.*

Immigration and Social Security Co-ordination (EU Withdrawal) Act 2020: Extension to Jersey by Order in Council. P.140/2020.  
 Lodged: 21st October 2020.  
*Chief Minister.*

CI Lottery: Allocation of 2019 Proceeds. Lodged: 21st October 2020. <i>Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture.</i>	P.141/2020.
CI Lottery: allocation of 2019 proceeds (P.141/2020) – amendment. Lodged: 2nd November 2020. <i>Deputy G.C.U. Guida of St. Lawrence</i>	P.141/2020. Amd.
Jersey Heritage Trust: Amendments to Constitution. Lodged: 21st October 2020. <i>Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture.</i>	P.142/2020.
Draft Amendment (No.49) of the Standing Orders of The States of Jersey. Lodged: 22nd October 2020. <i>Deputy S.M. Wickenden of St. Helier.</i>	P.143/2020.
Draft Amendment (No.50) of the Standing Orders of The States of Jersey. Lodged: 22nd October 2020. <i>Senator L.J. Farnham.</i>	P.144/2020.
Draft Geographical Indications (Jersey) Regulations 202-. Lodged: 30th October 2020. <i>Minister for External Relations.</i>	P.145/2020.
Secondary Employment of Public Sector Employees: Review of Policies. Lodged: 30th October 2020. <i>Deputy J.M. Maçon of St. Saviour.</i>	P.146/2020.
Draft Finance (2021 Budget) (Jersey) Law 202-. Lodged: 2nd November 2020. <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources.</i>	P.147/2020.
Draft Social Security (Amendment of Law No. 15) (Jersey) Regulations 202-. Lodged: 2nd November 2020. <i>Minister for Social Security.</i>	P.148/2020.
Vote of No Confidence: Chief Minister. Lodged: 2nd November 2020. <i>Senator K.L. Moore.</i>	P.149/2020.
Social Security Medical Appeal Tribunal: appointment of Chair. Lodged: 2nd November 2020. <i>Minister for Social Security.</i>	P.150/2020.
Jersey Employment and Discrimination Tribunal: appointment of members. Lodged: 2nd November 2020. <i>Minister for Social Security.</i>	P.151/2020.
Social Security Tribunal: appointment of Chair. Lodged: 2nd November 2020. <i>Minister for Social Security.</i>	P.152/2020.

**Public Accounts Committee: appointment of elected members**

In accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 123(1), the Chair of the Public Accounts Committee made the following nominations as elected members of the Public Accounts Committee –

The Connétable of St. Peter  
 The Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy Jessica Harriet Perchard of St. Saviour

There being no other nominations, the Bailiff declared that the Connétable of St. Peter, the Connétable of St. Martin and Deputy Jessica Harriet Perchard of St. Saviour had been duly appointed as elected members of the Public Accounts Committee.

**Written Questions**

*(see Official Report/Hansard)*

- WQ.399/2020 1. The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy J.H. Perchard of St. Saviour regarding Islanders classed as being at highest risk in respect of Covid-19.
- WQ.400/2020 2. The Minister for Social Security tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy J.H. Perchard of St. Saviour regarding the reduction of Social Security contributions in response to Covid-19.
- WQ.401/2020 3. The Minister for Education tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy J.H. Perchard of St. Saviour regarding the impact of Covid-19 on teaching and learning.
- WQ.402/2020 4. The Minister for Children and Housing tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy J.H. Perchard of St. Saviour regarding the support available to disadvantaged children and families.
- WQ.403/2020 5. The Minister for the Environment tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy J.H. Perchard of St. Saviour regarding the relationship between property size and the number of occupants.
- WQ.404/2020 6. The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy L.M.C. Doublet of St. Saviour regarding the Maternity Voices Partnership.
- WQ.405/2020 7. The Minister for Children and Housing tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy L.M.C. Doublet of St. Saviour regarding measures to ensure children understood that smacking was not permitted.
- WQ.406/2020 8. The Minister for Children and Housing tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy L.M.C. Doublet of St. Saviour regarding the impact of Covid-19 on parents-to-be, young children and their families.
- WQ.407/2020 9. The Minister for Education tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier regarding the allocation of resources to ‘catch-up’ programmes in schools.
- WQ.408/2020 10. The Minister for the Environment tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier regarding the application of the Public Health and Safety (Rented Dwellings) (Jersey) Law 2018.
- WQ.409/2020 11. The Minister for Infrastructure tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier regarding cycling projects.

- WQ.410/2020 12. The Minister for Treasury and Resources tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier regarding hotel rooms provided for workers having to self-isolate.
- WQ.411/2020 13. The Minister for Treasury and Resources tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier regarding the employees of States-owned companies who had been signed off work due to stress.
- WQ.412/2020 14. The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by the Connétable of St. Martin regarding access to endocrinology services.
- WQ.414/2020 15. H.M. Attorney General tabled an answer to a question asked by the Connétable of St. Martin regarding legislative changes arising from the establishment of multi-Parish electoral constituencies.
- WQ.415/2020 16. The Chair of the Privileges and Procedures Committee tabled an answer to a question asked the Connétable of St. Martin by regarding Draft Amendment (No. 49) of the Standing Orders of the States of Jersey (P.143/2020).
- WQ.416/2020 17. The Minister for International Development tabled an answer to a question asked by the Connétable of St. Martin regarding the report on Island identity and Jersey's International Profile Policy.
- WQ.417/2020 18. The Minister for Infrastructure tabled an answer to a question asked by the Connétable of St. Helier regarding the development of transport strategies.
- WQ.418/2020 19. The Chief Minister tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier regarding the impact of the use of agency and locum staff in the Department of Health and Community Services.
- WQ.419/2020 20. The Chair of the Privileges and Procedures Committee tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade regarding the translation of speeches made in the Assembly.
- WQ.420/2020 21. The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier regarding waiting lists.
- WQ.421/2020 22. The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy I. Gardiner of St. Helier regarding the testing regime for Covid-19.
- WQ.422/2020 23. The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy I. Gardiner of St. Helier regarding the positive cases of Covid-19 identified in Jersey.
- WQ.423/2020 24. The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy I. Gardiner of St. Helier regarding staffing levels at the General Hospital.
- WQ.424/2020 25. The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier regarding the use of agency and locum staff.

### **Oral Questions**

*(see Official Report/Hansard)*

- OQ.308/2020 1. Deputy G.J. Truscott of St. Brelade asked a question of the Minister for Infrastructure regarding the maintenance of public parks, gardens and housing estate hedges and verges.

- OQ.294/2020 2. The Deputy of St. Martin asked a question of the Assistant Minister for Education regarding the arrangements for Jersey students to return to Jersey for Christmas.
- OQ.298/2020 3. The Connétable of Trinity asked a question of the Minister for Infrastructure regarding the prioritisation of safe walking and cycling routes.
- OQ.291/2020 4. Deputy L.M.C. Doublet of St. Saviour asked a question of the Minister for Health and Social Services regarding the scientific evidence to support the announcement that masks should be worn in indoor public spaces.
- OQ.314/2020 5. Deputy S.M. Ahier of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Treasury and Resources regarding the proposal to move prior-year basis taxpayers to pay on a current-year basis.
- OQ.292/2020 6. Deputy I. Gardiner of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Health and Social Services regarding the staffing of the General Hospital during the winter period.
- OQ.304/2020 7. Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Education regarding the testing of school staff for Covid-19.
- OQ.302/2020 8. The Connétable of St. Martin asked a question of the Chief Minister regarding Government support to charities providing vital services to Islanders.
- OQ.306/2020 9. The Deputy of St. Mary asked a question of the Minister for Health and Social Services regarding the review of existing restrictions applicable to small gatherings of musicians and singers.
- OQ.301/2020 10. Senator K.L. Moore asked a question of the Minister for Education regarding the employment of educational psychologists and wellbeing officers.
- OQ.293/2020 11. Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawrence asked a question of the Minister for Children and Housing regarding the proposed care memorial.
- OQ.299/2020 12. Deputy K.G. Pamplin of St. Saviour asked a question of the Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture regarding the work being undertaken to ensure Jersey's supply chain was prepared for the post-Brexit period.
- OQ.309/2020 13. The Connétable of St. Brelade asked a question of the Minister for the Environment regarding the resourcing of the planning function.
- OQ.315/2020 14. Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Health and Social Services regarding the vacancy rate amongst nurses.
- OQ.311/2020 15. Deputy M.R. Higgins of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Health and Social Services regarding the criteria to be used when deciding whether to implement a lock-down in Jersey.
- OQ.295/2020 16. The Deputy of St. Martin asked a question of the Minister for Health and Social Services regarding the level of public compliance with the guidance that face masks should be worn in all indoor public places.
- OQ.303/2020 17. The Connétable of St. Martin asked a question of the Assistant Minister for the Environment regarding the protection of the welfare of livestock.
- OQ.296/2020 18. Deputy L.M.C. Doublet of St. Saviour asked a question of the Minister for Health and Social Services regarding the development of a policy to allow safe singing.

- OQ.313/2020** 19. Deputy G.J. Truscott of St. Brelade asked a question of the Assistant Chief Minister regarding the plans to address traffic around Overdale in the event the site was confirmed as the location of the new Hospital.
- OQ.307/2020** 20. Deputy I. Gardiner of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Infrastructure regarding the introduction of a framework to allow lift services such as Uber to operate.
- OQ.297/2020** 21. Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawrence asked a question of the Chair of the States Employment Board regarding the appointment of the Chief Executive as a non-executive director of a U.K. real estate company.

### **Arrangement of public business for the present meeting**

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Chief Minister, agreed that the Chief Minister would make a statement regarding the appointment of the Chief Executive as a non-executive director of a U.K. real estate company prior to the period of Oral Questions without notice.

Members present voted as follows –

#### **POUR: 33**

Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré  
 Senator T.A. Vallois  
 Senator S.W. Pallett  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy R. Labey (H)  
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)  
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)  
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)  
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)  
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)  
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)  
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

#### **CONTRE: 6**

Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)

#### **ABSTAIN: 1**

Senator S.Y. Mézec



**Statements on a matter of official responsibility***(see Official Report/Hansard)*

The Chief Minister made a statement regarding the appointment of the Chief Executive as a non-executive director of a U.K. real estate company.

**Arrangement of public business for the present meeting**

THE STATES rejected a proposition of Senator Lyndon John Farnham that the Assembly should adjourn.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 14**

Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Senator K.L. Moore  
 Senator S.W. Pallett  
 Senator S.Y. Mézec  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)  
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)

**CONTRE: 25**

Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré  
 Senator T.A. Vallois  
 Connétable of St. Clément  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy R. Labey (H)  
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)  
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)  
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0****Oral Questions without notice***(see Official Report/Hansard)*

The Minister for Social Security answered questions without notice from members.

The Chief Minister answered questions without notice from members.

**Adjournment**

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Tuesday 3rd November 2020 to consider the items of public business listed for the meeting.

THE STATES rose at 6.11 p.m.

**DR. M. EGAN**

*Greffier of the States*